South Asian Archaeology
2001

Edited by
Catherine Jarrige and Vincent Lefèvre

Volume II
Historical Archaeology and Art History

Éditions Recherche sur les Civilisations
Cover: Bāmiyān. 55 m Buddha niche.
East side wall, crowned Buddha (Śākyamuni).

adpf association pour la diffusion de la pensée française

Éditions Recherche sur les Civilisations
Ministère des Affaires étrangères
Direction générale de la Coopération internationale
et du Développement
Sous-direction des Sciences sociales et de l'Archéologie
6, rue Ferrus 75683 Paris cedex 14

ISBN : 2-86538-301-6
© adpf – Éditions Recherche sur les Civilisations, Paris, 2005
South Asian Archaeology 2001

Proceedings of the Sixteenth International Conference of the European Association of South Asian Archaeologists, held in Collège de France, Paris, 2-6 July 2001

Edited by
Catherine Jarrige and Vincent Lefèvre

Volume II
Historical Archaeology and Art History

Editions Recherche sur les Civilisations
Table of contents
Volume II

NAMAN P. AHUJA
Changing Gods, Enduring Rituals: Observations on Early Indian Religion as seen through Terracotta Imagery, c. 200 BC-AD 100 ........................................... 345

EVA ALLINGER
An Unusual Depiction of Aṣṭāmāhābhaya Tārā in Nako/Himachal Pradesh as Compared with Other Representations of the Same Tārā in the Western Himalaya .... 355

MUHAMMAD ASHRAF KHAN
Recent Discoveries in the Ancient Gandhara Region and Adjoining Areas with Special Emphasis on District Attock in the Punjab-Pakistan .................................................. 363

JOACHIM K. BAUTZE
Painting at Karauli ................................................. 365

CLAUDINE BAUTZE-PICRON
Death at the Gate of Hindu Temples and Shrines, 5th to 7th century ..................... 375

KURT BEHRENDT
Narrative Sequences in the Buddhist Reliefs from Gandhāra .............................................. 383

GOURISWAR BHATTACHARYA
Identification of a Strange Stone Image from Nepal: Nepal and Tamil Nadu Connection .................................................. 393

PIA BRANCACCIO
Perceptions of “Westerners” in Sātavāhana Times: The Archaeological Evidence ........ 401

M. BRANDTNER, B. MISRA, P. MOHANTY & P. YULE

PIERFRANCESCO CALLIERI
Excavations of the ISIAO Italian Archaeological Mission in Pakistan at Bir-kot-ghwanḍai, Swat: the Sacred Building on the Citadel .................................. 417
MARTHA L. CARTER
Indo-Scythian Regalia: The Numismatic Evidence ................................................. 427

ROSA MARIA CIMINO
The Wall Paintings Temple’s of Mahuva Wala Akhada, at Nathdwara .................... 437

HARRY FALK
The Buddha’s Begging Bowl ......................................................................................... 445

ANNA FILIGENZI
Stone and Stucco Sculptures from the Sacred Building of Bir-kot-ghwanđai, Swat, Pakistan .......................................................... 453

VASUNDHARA FILJOZAT
Jaykaṇācārī Temples in Kārnāṭaka ........................................................................ 463

GERARD FOEKEMA
Architectural Features of the Later Medieval Temples of Kārnāṭaka, 1000-1300 AD 475

LARS FOGELIN
Recent Research at the Buddhist Monastery of Thotakonda ................................. 483

SUCHANDRA GHOSH
A Mahānāvika in an Inscription from Coastal Andhra Pradesh and Related Archaeological Issues .......................................................... 491

JOHN GUY
Southern Buddhism: Traces and Transmission ........................................................ 495

ENAMUL HQUE, S.S. MOSTAFIZUR RAHMAN & S.M. KAMRUL AHSAN
A Preliminary Report on Wari-Bateshwar Trial Excavation by ICSBA ..................... 505

JULIA A.B. HEGEWALD
From Śiva to Pārśvanātha: The Appropriation of a Hindu Temple for Jaina Worship 517

OSKAR VON HINÖBER
Bronzes from Gilgit and Their Inscriptions ................................................................. 525

KLAUS KARTTUNEN
Western Coins in South Asia: A Literary Perspective ............................................... 531
DEBORAH KLIMBURG-SALTER
Mahākāśyapa and the Art of Bāmiyān ........................................ 535

CECELIA LEVIN
Looking Southwards: Early Pāṇḍya Art and its Impact on the Evolution of Hindu Sculptural Style .................................................. 551

BARRY LEWIS
The Mysore Kingdom at AD 1800:
Archaeological Applications of the Mysore Survey of Colin Mackenzie ................................................................. 557

B.R. MANI
Date of the Akhnur Buddhist Terracottas in the Light of Recent Excavations at Ambaran (Akhnur) ........................................ 567

MICHAEL W. MEISTER with ABDUR REHMAN
Archaeology at Kafirkot ................................................................. 571

GERD J.R. MEVissen
Ladies and Planets:
Images of female deities accompanied by graha figures .................. 579

eva myrdal
Rice and Millet Land-Use and Control of Resources in Dry Zone Sri Lanka 1st Millennium AD .................................................... 589

Alka Patel
A Note on Mahmūd Ghaznavi, Somanātha, and the Building of a Reputation ................................................................. 599

Cameron A. petrie
The Late 1st and Early 2nd Millennia AD at Akra, N.W.F.P., Pakistan ................................................................. 607

Ellen M. Raven
Candragupta II, the Lion-Slayer ..................................................... 615

Charlotte Schmid
Of Gods and Mortals: Lilā Cōla ..................................................... 623

Carolyn Woodford schmidt
The Wreath-Bearing Bodhisattva: Ongoing Typological Studies of Bodhisattva Images from Sahri-Bahlol .................................... 637
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gautam Sengupta</td>
<td>Art of South-Western Bengal: A Framework For Enquiry</td>
<td>649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. V. Sharma</td>
<td>Identification of Akbar's Gangā-Sāgar at Fatehpur Sikri</td>
<td>659</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julia Shaw</td>
<td>The Archaeological Setting of Buddhist Monasteries in Central India: a Summary of a Multi-Phase Survey in the Sanchi Area, 1998-2000</td>
<td>665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Skilling</td>
<td>“Buddhist Sealings”: Reflections on Terminology, Motivation, Donors’ Status, School-Affiliation, and Print-Technology</td>
<td>677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Michael Tartakov</td>
<td>Vṛṣabha Nandi in the Art of the Early Calukya</td>
<td>687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anne Vergati</td>
<td>The Image of the Rāiput Hero in North Indian Art (West Rājasthān) 16th-19th centuries</td>
<td>697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monika Zin</td>
<td>The Unknown Ajanta Painting of the Aṅgulimāla Story</td>
<td>705</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fig. 1 – Ajanta, Cave XVII, veranda, second window niche in the right rear wall; painting on the left side (computer-generated image combining two photographs).
The Unknown Ajanta Painting of the Aṅgulimālā Story

MONIKA ZIN

Of all the verandas in the Ajanta complex, the one in front of cave XVII is in the best condition. Although some parts of the paintings are severely damaged, particularly in their lower parts, what remains allows us to identify the narrative (Schlingloff 2000: Nos. 24,68,69,77,83) and devotional representations, among them the famous Wheel of Existences (Zin 2002: No. 46) and rocky landscapes around two Bodhisatva kings (Zin 2003: No. 42,14-15). The paintings featured on this veranda are among the most frequently published images from Ajanta. From the veranda a door on the cave’s central axis leads into the cave, and two windows on either side of the door once allowed light and air to filter in. In the nineteenth century, however, they were fitted with thick window frames and wire-netting. This is the reason, incidentally, for the increased humidity and lack of ventilation which have caused the deterioration of paintings inside the cave. The window niches in the approximately one-meter-thick wall offered welcome extra space for painting. What has survived until today are the paintings in both niches to the right of the door. Although poorly preserved, the paintings are of a high artistic quality and allow us to determine their religious content. Thus in the first niche there is a representation of the Rāhula episode (Schlingloff 2000: No. 71), on the opposite side. In the same niche we can see the story of the youth Sumati (Schlingloff 2000: No. 72) to whom the Buddha Dipankara predicted his future Buddha hood. Similarly, the niche of the second window is also painted. Its right side shows a devotional image of the Bodhisatva Avalokiteśvara (Zin 2003: No. 45.6). The mural on the opposite side is in no poorer condition than the other three, but elements that would allow an interpretation are not easily recognisable. This is obviously the reason that the painting has never been published.

The right side of the narrow painting (Fig. 1) depicts the Buddha standing on a lotus. Like in the other paintings, the installation of the window frame cut off part of the Buddha’s body. But it is unlikely that any significant iconographical elements were lost by the removal of this part. The scene takes place in front of the Buddha. Four figures are visible: at the bottom, below the base of the Buddha’s lotus, a man squats or bows down on one knee and is worshipping the Buddha with his hands folded together in a gesture of reverence. Above this person there is another figure, or perhaps the same person in a different scene. The figure is depicted in a dynamic movement and approaches the Buddha. The depiction of the head is peculiar (Fig. 2): the hair is standing on end as it is the case with demons and - unique in Ajanta - is decorated with small ringlets. Above this person there is

Fig. 2 – Detail from Fig. 1.
a flying dwarf. Such dwarfs are often depicted in Ajanta as bearers of garlands or umbrellas. This particular dwarf, however, is not flying towards but away from the Buddha. His hands are held in a gesture of horror, a sign which is not only frequently found in the paintings of Ajanta but is also a universally recognisable expression of fear.

Once this mood of fright is determined, it is no longer difficult to accurately identify this scene. There are only very few episodes in which the Buddha is involved in a situation that conveys a similar mood. As generally recognised, the episode may illustrate the assaults of Devadatta or the conversion of an aggressive person. The hair on the head of the aggressive person in our picture, standing on end in demon fashion, could give the impression that this is a scene which cannot be more specifically identified than one which shows the conversion of an evil Yaksa. But at the bottom of the painting, a clear sign has survived that points to a different interpretation (Fig. 3): a sword lies on the ground which the converted person has obviously dropped. If the aggressive person is the same as the one kneeling, he would have to be equipped with a sword, who would certainly be shown ready to attack. On the left edge of the painting we can see a preserved fragment of a vertically displayed object which is of exactly the same colour as the sword lying on the ground (Fig. 4). The painting’s reconstruction results in the following (Fig. 5): a person with a drawn sword is striding toward the Buddha, and, below, he kneels. The sword he has dropped is lying next to him on the ground.

The scene is well-known and can be easily identified. It is the story of the conversion of An̄gulimāla, the mass murderer.

There are frequent references to and narrations of this story in Buddhist literature, often in the connection with a Jātaka about An̄gulimāla’s previous life as the man-eating demon Saudāsa, who was converted by the righteous king Sutasoma and freed from his murderous impulse. It is possible that the story of An̄gulimāla derived from the Saudāsa narrative, known since the Veda. Both stories deal with the fundamental problem of true Brahmanhood. In one of the Buddhist narratives about Saudāsa we find a sentence central to An̄gulimāla’s conversion: “I am standing still, you are not standing still.”

The oldest surviving version of the An̄gulimāla story consists of 25 verses of Theragāthā. Apart from the dialogue, based on the play of words phīlathī, which takes place between An̄gulimāla and the Buddha “I am standing still, you are not standing still”, we learn that the present Thera is the son of a Brahman. He used to be hīnsaka, the bloodthirsty robber An̄gulimāla, and is now ahiṃsaka and the son of the Buddha.

Still, in the canonical literature there is a story which is actually nothing other than a commentary on this section of the “Verses of the Monks”. It is the An̄gulimāla-sutta in the Majjhimaṁbhāya, in which the verses of Theragāthā are repeated. Both the name of An̄gulimāla and the meaning of the verse phīlathī are explained here. The story is set in Śrāvasti, An̄gulimāla is a wanted murderer who kills the inhabitants of entire villages and towns.
and who wears a garland (mālā) made of his victims’ fingers (ānguli). King Prasenajit organises a military expedition to hunt down the mass murderer. The Buddha goes into the forest in which Āṅgulimāla lives and performs a miracle – the robber cannot catch up with him. “Stand still!” Āṅgulimāla calls. “I am standing still, you are not standing still!” the Buddha replies and – by subsequently explaining that a monk arrests his desires – he converts Āṅgulimāla and takes him to a monastery. King Prasenajit visits the Buddha and is delighted to learn that the vicious murderer can no longer cause any harm.

The same story is also found in the northern Buddhist tradition, namely in the fragmentary Sanskrit manus-
him the necessity of killing his student himself—a move that would naturally spoil his reputation. The plot, with its Hippolytus motif and the teacher’s demand that the youth kill one hundred people and cut off their fingers, culminates in the addition of the murderer’s mother, who was to be his final victim and at the last moment is spared certain death by Buddha’s conversion of Aṅgulimāla. Other versions of the story extend the number of victims to one thousand and deepen the plot by the addition of a mother driven into the forest out of a touching desire to bring her son something to eat (Der Weise und der Thor: 300-307, 324-26; Chavannes 1910-34, Vol. 4: 110-111).

The question must be raised whether the motif of the mother, which arises from the demand of a vindictive teacher, should in fact be viewed as a later development of the text (as Bareau argued 1985-86) or whether the story already incorporated this motif at an earlier date and was simply not always referred to in its entirety in the texts available to us.

The same episodes with a wife in love, a teacher’s demand to kill one thousand people and a mother carrying food also occur in a Pali commentary literature from the 5th century, namely in Papancaśīḍanī and Paramattadhāpamī. It appears that these narratives, which underwent changes in both the northern and southern traditions, stem from a common and most likely canonical text which has not survived until the present day.

Art also provides evidence that all of the story’s episodes were known in earlier times, both in the South and in the North. The mother was part of the narrative from an early date.

The oldest known reliefs of the Aṅgulimāla episode stem from temporally close epochs but geographically distant regions, namely from Amaravati and Gandhara. In
one Amaravati frieze11 the story is reduced to one picture. Angulimāla is seen here twice: firstly with a raised sword attacking the Buddha (depicted in the form of a column of fire), and secondly kneeling before him. Opposite the Buddha there is a female figure with a pot, obviously the mother. The same scene is presented in another Amaravati relief (Fig. 6). Here the group below represents the early deeds of Angulimāla, perhaps related to the military operations organised by King Prasenajit. On the left side monks are seated, probably observing Angulimāla’s admission to the monastery. There is no sign of a garland of fingers on Angulimāla, all he is wearing is a Brahman’s string. Another relief (Fig. 7-8), from Nagarjunikonda, to my knowledge previously unidentified, is not difficult to interpret even though it is badly damaged: the middle section at the right shows the killings, while at the left Angulimāla is presented on his knees before the Buddha. The mother can be seen standing on the other side of the Buddha. The upper section shows the visit of King Prasenajit, while on the right side Angulimāla is seen shaving in preparation for his entry into monkhood. Though rather damaged, the lowest section is key to determining the date that the Angulimāla story existed with all its components. It shows nothing other than one episode from the early life of the future mass murderer – a scene at school. On the right side, the teacher’s wife stands with her husband, she who caused the 99-fold misfortune. As already mentioned, the earliest surviving reference to this episode in southern Indian literature derives from the 5th century.12 The relief pre-dates it by c. two centuries.

While the damaged relief from Nagarjunikonda does not reveal any more details, one can make out that the murderer is wearing an extremely broad Brahman string yajñopavita. This could be the garland of fingers. Angulimāla appears to be taking it off as he kneels before the Buddha.

The reliefs from Gandhara present the Angulimāla story in two or three successive scenes in the space of just one picture. Angulimāla attacks the Buddha with a sword, while his mother is standing nearby, he is then
shown on his knees before the Buddha (Fig. 9), or there is an additional scene in which the murderer is attacking the mother (Fig. 10). A painting in Hadda is arranged in the same manner. In contrast, paintings from Central Asia only show Aṅgulimāla’s attack, sometimes with the mother on the other side of the Buddha. While the Central Asian paintings depict the appearance of Aṅgulimāla in a conventional way, in Gandhara he is equipped with an attribute – namely a characteristic head-dress. At times it appears to be a crown of fingers. But the individual parts of the crown are sometimes too large to be intended as fingers, above all 99 or even 999 of them. Brancaecio (1999) identifies them as the head ornaments of savage forest inhabitants. Aṅgulimāla’s crown is also reminiscent of demons’ hair standing on end.

In what is to my knowledge the only depiction of the Aṅgulimāla story in the art of Pala (Fig. 11), in which the murderer is seen drawing his sword on one side of the Buddha and the mother is found on the other, Aṅgulimāla’s head is portrayed in a peculiar manner. Above the forehead there are small ringlets, above which in turn we see hair standing on end in typical demon fashion. And above this there are five round objects, the significance of which is unclear to me. They might be the curls of a Brahman pupil, or spherical objects with which certain demons or Māra are equipped. What is certain is that the pointed shapes on Aṅgulimāla’s head in the Pala sculpture are not the leaf crown of an āstari or a finger garland. The finger garland, incidentally, is featured here in the form of a yajñopavīta.

Following this summary of comparable Indian depictions, we return to the Ajanta painting. Aṅgulimāla is shown here twice, during the attack and after his conversion. It is very unlikely that the mother was also represented. If she was, the picture was destroyed when the window frame was installed.

The hair of the attacking Aṅgulimāla stands on end, demon fashion, and above the forehead there are the same type of small ringlets as found in the Pala sculpture. Unfortunately, the top of the head is no longer visible, so it is impossible to determine whether the five spherical objects were also part of the composition. Even without these objects, the murderer’s appearance is far more reminiscent of the Pala sculpture than depictions found in other regions. However, the finger garland is not shown here, neither in the form of a yajñopavīta nor as a crown. Perhaps the garland was depicted lying on the ground. A fragment of a no longer identifiable brightly coloured object can be recognised above the sword. Directly vertically above this unidentifiable remnant there is the left hand of the upright Aṅgulimāla, in which there seems to be something reminiscent of a pearl necklace. Perhaps it was the grisly garland, aṅgulimālā.

Contrary to the art of Amaravati and Gandhara, where the conversions of Yaksas and Nāgas are frequently depicted, the paintings in Ajanta do not feature conquests of the evil-minded. Obviously such stories were not popular among donors in this region. For this reason the Aṅgulimāla painting is exceptional. It may be, however, that the painting was not created to depict a dif-
ficult conversion. The paintings in the neighbouring niche portray the stories of Rāhula and Sumati. We know the two pictures belong together because they appear alongside one another in other places, namely in other paintings in Ajanta (Vasant 1991) and in reliefs in Gandhara (Taddei 1974, 1992). This raises the question of whether the Angulimāla painting was conceived together with another painting in the same niche. The painting on the opposite side depicts a certain Bodhisatva, most likely Avalokiteśvara, who is being worshipped by women. As proven by Pal (1974: 33-34), Avalokiteśvara was worshipped by women hoping to conceive. In this light the Angulimāla painting acquires new significance. Integral to this story is the angulimālaparītta, a protective formula used for births. It is derived from the “word of truth” and refers to true Brahmanhood.

All illustrations (unless specified) by author.

Fig. 11 – Relief from Nalanda (?), Pala Period, 9th century. 20 1/2 × 13 × 6 inches. Elvehjem Museum of Art, University of Wisconsin-Madison. Gift of Mr. and Mrs. Earl Morse 1972.26. © Elvehjem Museum of Art.
NOTES


2 For records of the story of Saṇḍāsa, representations in art as well as references to the research on the narrative material of Saṇḍāsa / Kalmidasa, cf. Schilling 2000: No 56 (Vuṣṇumara).

3 Jātaka 537, ed. Vol. 475: tipākāthās maccio ca sa traṃ gacchati yammanyinm āgatiḥ (āghatiḥ 'āghatiḥ lapastā kaholmaci kām tr saman yamiṣaṃ samātā ca me maññasā hampattan iti) ; trans.: 259: “Although I bid thee stand, thou still dost forward fly, an crying "Lo! I stand, methinks thou dost but lie: Unseemly! 'tis this sword, O priest, thou must assume to be a harmless shaft equipped with heron's plume.”

4 Theragāthā 866-891, ed. pp. 80-82; transl. pp. 82-84.

5 Theraghāthā 866, ed. pp. 80-81: gacchant vaddi

REFERENCES


T = Taishō Shinshō Daizōkyō, Tokyo, 1924ff.


The Unknown Ajanta Painting | ZIN |